



23925 Woodward Avenue
Pleasant Ridge, Michigan 48069

Pleasant Ridge Public Hearing and Regular City Commission Meeting
Tuesday, June 14, 2011

Having been duly publicized, Mayor Castelli called the meeting to order at 7:33 p.m.

Present: Mayor Castelli, Commissioners Bushey, Kellett, Lenko, Rubino
Also Present: City Manager Ball, City Attorney Cooper, City Clerk Allison
Absent: None

Minutes

11-2743

Motion by Commissioner Kellett, second by Commissioner Bushey, that the minutes of the Regular City Commissioner meeting held Tuesday, May 14, 2011, be approved, as presented.

Adopted: Yeas: Commissioners Kellett, Bushey, Lenko, Rubino, Mayor Castelli.
Nays: None.

May 2011 Disbursement Report

11-2744

Motion by Commissioner Rubino, second by Commissioner Lenko, that the May 2011 Disbursement Report be approved, as listed.

Adopted: Yeas: Commissioners Rubino, Lenko, Bushey, Kellett, Mayor Castelli.
Nays: None.

Governmental Reports

Chief Kevin Sullivan, Ferndale Fire Department, gave an update regarding the event related to the department.

Liaison Reports

Commissioner Rubino had no report related to the Ferndale Public Schools

Commissioner Bushey gave an update on the Recreation Commission. Projects related to the Recreation Commission as getting into shape. Community Garden will be ready for planting shortly.

Commissioner Kellett gave an update on the Historical Commission. Home and Garden tour, was a success and well attended.

Commissioner Lenko gave an update regarding the Planning Commission/DDA. Last meeting was well attended by residents. Business district improvements were also discussed.

Agreement - City of Berkley Fire Protection Services

(Berkley Mayor Marilyn Stephan, the Berkley City Manager Jane Bias-Disessa, the Berkley Director of Public Safety Richard Eshman, and the Berkley Public Safety Deputy Director Robert North were in attendance)

City Manager Ball reported on the background and a brief timeline of the proposed agreement with the City of Berkley to provide fire protection services. She indicated a public safety concept has been explored for the last several years as a way to enhance and expand the current police department without eliminating services, while offering additional training for the City of Pleasant Ridge of Police Officers.

Mayor Castelli commented at length on the history of the Pleasant Ridge Police Department and the City of Ferndale Fire Department, addressing all three items on the agenda relating to Public Safety.

Deputy Chief Robert North, Berkley Public Safety Department, gave an overview of the public safety model that has been in place successfully in the City of Berkley.

Commissioner Frank Rubino also commented that the public safety model has also been in place in the City of Fraser, and it has also been successful in that community.

Mr. Devin Benner, 41 Oakdale, questioned what enhanced training does a Public Safety Officer (PSO) have unlike and Emergency Medical Technician (EMT).

Mr. Mike Koehler, from Alliance Ambulance Services, responded that EMT's have additional training and can perform such tests as Blood Sugar levels and administer medications such as an

epi-pen. He also stated that Alliance has contracts with six Oakland County communities and a fleet of 25 ambulances. In order to service these communities, Alliance stations rigs in the communities they service, when one unit is called into operation, they use GPS to determine who is closest to the call, initiates the rig and the other remaining units shift positions, so that one area is not left without a nearby unit. He further addressed the rates charged by Alliance.

Ms. Laurie Thiel, Alliance Ambulance Services, commented currently, there is a two tier rate system, Basic and Advanced. The Basic rate is \$450, plus \$.12/mile. Advanced is \$500, plus \$.12/mile. Insurance companies are billed first, and any amount not covered under insurance would be billable to the patient.

Mr. Ron Hostettler, 53 Woodward Heights, questioned the costs related to the Ferndale Fire Department for ambulance services.

Mayor Castelli commented that patients still receive a bill from Ferndale Fire. A city employee recently received a bill for \$588.00, for an ambulance run by the Ferndale Fire Department.

Jason Krzysiak, 55 Wellesley, thanked the City Commission for their service to the City. Has concerns regarding the new public safety model. He feels the safety of neighborhood should take precedence over all other spending concerns. He further commented that the City Commission has acted independently regarding the public safety issue and no citizen input was allowed. Citizens should have had more say as to what is going to happen relating to police and fire. Other communities went out for a vote for a millage, feels voters should have more input. He urged the City Commission table items 8, 9 and 10 of tonight's agenda, in order to allow for a public hearing, ballot referendum or millage vote in November.

Ms. Helaine Zack, Oakland County Commissioner/Huntington Woods resident (8320 Hendrie), commented she feels that the City of Pleasant Ridge and the City of Huntington Woods are similar communities. She understands the budget challenges faced by communities in these times. The City of Huntington Woods is also a public safety department, and she feels it is a wonderful service. She commented that residents would not see any decrease in services by merging to a public safety department. Huntington Woods public safety also partners with the City of Berkley for weekend coverage.

Ms. Kim Malloy, 7 Kenberton, commented she has lived in communities that offer public safety and lived in others where there was a separate police and fire department. She introduced Dan Daws.

Mr. Dan Daws, 6th District President of the Michigan Professional Fire Fighters Union. He has some experience with the PSO model. He has been in fire service for thirty years, EMS for twenty-eight years, and has worked for private EMS service. He has extensive experience in separate police and fire departments. PSO model is often touted as being cost effective. It can save money, but by cutting costs, he feels that services are also cut. For the same level of service that Pleasant Ridge has now, the PSO model will cost the same amount of money, if not more. He commented that the PSO department in the City of Kalamazoo, costs more than other similar communities with separate police and fire services. Fire and police training are separate types of

training and both professions find it hard to keep up with all the additional training with is required. Having more police officers on the road means having less firefighters. Both jobs cannot be done simultaneously. By law, one person cannot go into a situation, without another firefighter to go in and two other firefighters are outside, unless it is a true life safety issue. He stated that police officers working for Kalamazoo prior to becoming public safety reported they had less passion for their job after the public safety model was adopted. A current benefit of having services provided by the City of Ferndale is the availability of the Oakway Mutual Aide pact, as opposed to the Oakland County Mutual Aide pack He feels the Oakway pact is the better option. Requested the City Commission not vote on these items tonight, and allow the citizens of the community to make the decision.

Deputy Chief North commented that he understands the two-on-two rule. Two people must be outside the building, while two people are on the inside. There are exceptions to that rule. He is in attendance to discuss the public safety model, not criticize the firefighters. Under the PSO model, a patrol car and the truck are dispatched at the same time, the patrol car usually arrives first and begins whatever process is necessary based on the situation. Berkley PSO are not paramedics, however, they are Medical First Responders.

Mayor Castelli commented Alliance stations an ambulance at I-696 and Coolidge. An ambulance is available for Pleasant Ridge calls. Ambulance rigs will constantly shift locations, so that a unit is within close proximity to Pleasant Ridge.

Mr. Don Jones, 50 Ridge Road, commented that if the agreement is signed, would ambulances be deployed to Pleasant Ridge.

Mayor Castelli commented that placement of an ambulance in Pleasant Ridge would be determined during contract negotiations.

Ms. Jessica McCarthy, 53 Wellesley, also owns a business at 24060 Woodward. Concerned about having two officers in one patrol car, and having them cross-trained, how would this effect response time. If there were a car accident, medical emergency or fire at the same time that her business is being held up and gunpoint, how would she be assured she would have the same response time that exists now. Since both officers would be in the same car.

Mayor Castelli commented that if that happened currently, and the officer was already responding to a call, she would have to wait – because there would not be another officer to respond. He further commented that there would not be two officers in the same car, there may be two officers patrolling the City in two different cars.

Ms. McCarthy further questions what other budgetary options have been considered. Have other City employees' salaries been considered? The cable access channel that no one seems to know what channel it is.

Mayor Castelli commented that City Hall is down to four days a week, salaries have been frozen for some time, fringe benefit costs have been passed on to employees. Some salaries have been

reduced because days working have been reduced, other salaries have remained the same since the same number of hours are being worked, even with the offices being closed.

Ms. McCarthy also commented that in a newspaper article from the Ferndale Patch, it was pointed out that from the City of Ferndale, there are five points of entry into the City of Pleasant Ridge for emergency services. There is only one point of entry from the City of Berkley, coming down Woodward Avenue. During inclement weather, during events such as the Dream Cruise, or just rush hour, response time is a major concern. She feels that the City Commission seems to be very comfortable with the PSO model, and legality the decision is up to the Commission, however, she feels that if the Commission has any respect for citizens, then citizens should be allowed to vote for it. If there is any other information that would convince citizens that the PSO model is the right thing to do, it should be presented and let the citizens decide.

Deputy Chief North responded that Woodward Avenue is one of the routes to Pleasant Ridge from Berkley, however there are four options available. For police response, cars will be patrolling the City. For ambulance response, there currently is an ambulance stationed at 696 and Coolidge. For fire response, it is a quick drive down Woodward, but for events such as Dream Cruise, equipment and manpower are relocated based on need.

Mr. Damian Gyorkos, 39 Devonshire, questioned what would happen if the negotiations with the City of Berkley do not work out. He also questioned if the PSO model was adopted, and within the next eight to ten years the City may lose four of the six officers to retirement, then the City of Pleasant Ridge would be left with two officers. Who will be responsible for replacing Pleasant Ridge officers. He finally had questions regarding ambulance response time.

Mayor Castelli commented that the City of Berkley agreement is on the agenda for consideration in the event that the City of Pleasant Ridge is unable to reach an agreement for public safety. He further commented that he has been in discussions with the City of Ferndale regarding renegotiating the contract and the City of Ferndale has not been receptive. Also, when officers will be replaced, decision would be made by the Berkley/Pleasant Ridge Department, shared power between the two communities.

Mr. Koehler, Alliance, commented that the average response time is five minutes. The units are normally located at I-696 and Coolidge.

Mr. Chris Kuzak, 12 Oakland Park, commented he understands business and budgets. He believes that residents want to keep separate police and fire departments and residents are willing to pay extra for these services. He questioned how an ambulance service determined, whether it is Basic or Advanced. Finally, he questioned how many officers are dedicated each shift. He commented that he is happy with what the City has now and would like the chance to vote if it is going to be changed.

Mr. Koehler responded that Advanced units respond to all 911 calls.

Deputy Chief North responded that the number of patrols on the road is dependent on available manpower, and the workload. Currently, the City of Berkley runs between four and six. With

respect to Pleasant Ridge, patrols would not be less than what is currently provided and a combined department would offer more when needed.

Ms. Suzanne Levin, 9 Maywood, questioned how many officers would be dedicated to Pleasant Ridge, what percentage of population of the two communities does Pleasant Ridge represent, what percentage of area does Pleasant Ridge represent, will the officers know the residents-as they do now. She further commented that she has concerns that a PSO will not be able to perform blood sugar levels or administer and epi-pen. Would also like to know if the situation where the two communities are not adjacent has been addressed, concerns with the proximity issue with the City of Berkley.

Mr. Mike McDonald, 33 Amherst, commented that he feels that citizens need to be involved in the decision process. Feels that the residents are happy with the way things have historically been. Understands this may be a matter of money. He would like to see proof of services provided and wants claims of what will be received proven. He has concerns with the distance between the City of Pleasant Ridge and the City of Berkley. Questioned whether other communities have been considered. Finally, he feels that this issue should be put to a vote after citizen involvement.

Ms. Amanda VanDusen, 12 Kenberton, commented that she is open to exploring the public safety arrangement with the City of Berkley, but understands more information is necessary for people to be comfortable with the decision. She understands that people want things to remain the same, however, with budget pressures, things will not stay the same. She feels that this needs to be explored and find a way to enhance the services the City already has. Revenue Sharing from the State will be tied to increases in collaborative services. Pleasant Ridge probably does more collaboration than any other community in the state, however, the State is requiring increased collaboration. The community should remain open to changes.

Ms. Karen Twomey, 12 Poplar Park, questioned how the change to the PSO model would affect the safety of 400 children in the school that borders Pleasant Ridge and Ferndale. Will the City of Ferndale still support the school if Pleasant Ridge backs out of the existing contract. She further commented that if people do not feel safe in a community, they will leave that community. An estimated eighty-six percent of people leave because of a perceived feeling of indifference.

Ms. Ann Perry, 35 Devonshire, thanked the City Commission for their service to the community.. She also thanked Commissioner Lenko for trying to communicate information to residents regarding this issue. She feels that this is a transparency issue. The plan may sound great, however, the proximity is an issue. Residents are concerned because they have not received any information regarding the public safety issue. Feels that the City of Pleasant Ridge is closely tied to the City of Ferndale; it is "organic." Feels the City should try to negotiate with Ferndale. Would like to have the citizens vote in this issue, residents should have a say in what happens.

Mr. Patrick Sheenan, Ferndale Firefighters Association President, commented that there is an eighty-eight year history between the City of Pleasant Ridge and the City of Ferndale for fire

protection services. He has viewed the informational video presented by the City of Pleasant Ridge, however, understands that residents are concerned and upset because they feel as if they have not been included in the decision process. In the video, it was stated that the City has been running unsafe for years, however, he was under the impression that the Pleasant Ridge Police received assistance from the Ferndale Police. Wanted to make Pleasant Ridge citizens aware that the city is not unmanned, because Pleasant Ridge receives assistance from Ferndale. He commented on the two in two out rule. Explained life is the number one priority, second is property. He has heard that Pleasant Ridge falls in line with Berkley, as there is not much commercial property. He feels that many of the homes in Pleasant Ridge compare to a commercial building when it comes to fighting fires. Feels that Governor Snyder's plan is not defined and is only making communities uncut each other and fight with each other. Questioned how cost savings would be achieved, why wasn't Ferndale considered for a merger. The budget numbers discussed have not been for comparable services. Feels this needs to be considered. With Ferndale, more people are able to respond quicker. While Ferndale is responding to a fire call, the Pleasant Ridge police officer would still be able to patrol the community. Would an officer be dedicated to Pleasant Ridge or would he be pulled from Pleasant Ridge if there was an emergency in Berkley. Does not see a benefit to Pleasant Ridge to switch. Commented regarding a study performed regarding national ambulance response time. The national average for response time by a private ambulance company is nine to ten minutes. Ferndale's response time is three to four minutes. An Oakway ambulance responds if Ferndale Fire contract respond. Commented on Commissioner Rubino's earlier comments relating to the City of Fraser. Finally, he feels the times have changed since Berkley went to the PSO model.

Commissioner Rubino commented that the reasoning for Fraser changing to PSO was due to budgeting. Questioned how many fire fighters are on duty at a time at Ferndale. What is Ferndale's minimum manpower standards. Is there the potential that the station closest to Pleasant Ridge is slated to close.

Mr. Sheehan responded up to eight men are on duty at a time. A minimum of six, however, the plan is to increase to an eight man minimum. He is not sure whether a station is slated to close. He is paid to protect the residents of Pleasant Ridge, Ferndale and Royal Oak Township, and he feels that is what he is doing at tonight's meeting.

Mr. Kevin Sullivan, Ferndale Fire Chief, commented that there is no plan for any station to close. It was a budget option in case the Headlee override was not approved.

Commissioner Kellett stated he appreciated the comments made by residents regarding this issue. Understands many residents feel strongly about the City of Pleasant Ridge, he would not be serving on the Commission for any other reason. He urged anyone wishing to obtain information to take a copy of the memo prepared by the City Manager relating to the public safety option. The memo explains the timeline to get to this point, information regarding negotiations with the cities of Ferndale and Huntington Woods. City Commission must consider the back up, just in case contract for Fire Services with the City of Berkley, the merger option with Berkley to form a joint public safety department as well as the notice that must be given to the City of Ferndale, regarding termination. He addressed why residents would not vote on this issue, based on the City Charter. As a City Commissioner, he must do what he feels

is in the best interest of the community. The Commission must move forward with this concept, this is not a done deal, details must be put in place.

Commissioner Lenko commented he wanted to thank the residents from their comments. He hopes to come to an agreement with the City of Berkley for public safety. The city is doing its due diligence to determine what is in the best interest in the City. The Ferndale Fire relationship does not address the situation with the Pleasant Ridge Police Department.

Commissioner Rubino commented that he lives in the community, as well as his family and grandkids. He would not approve any agreement that would put his family, or others, in jeopardy. Due diligence is still needs to be done.

(The foregoing to a summary of the comments. A videotape of the meeting is available)

Authorization for Ongoing Public Safety Negotiations

11-2745

Motion by Commissioner Kellett, second by Commissioner Rubino, that the City Commission authorize the City Manger to continue negotiations with the City of Berkley, regarding the development of an Intergovernmental Agreement for Public Safety Services.

Adopted: Yeas: Commissioners Rubino, Lenko, Bushey, Kellett, Mayor Castelli.
 Nays: None.

Fire Protection Agreement – City of Berkley 2013-2015

11-2746

Motion by Commissioner Rubino, second by Commissioner Bushey that the Agreement between the City of Pleasant Ridge and the City of Berkley for fire protection services to Pleasant Ridge be approved, effective if the City of Pleasant Ridge terminates its contract with the City of Ferndale for fire protection services, in the amount of \$104,000 in fiscal year 2013 and \$109,000 in fiscal year 2014.

Adopted: Yeas: Commissioners Rubino, Bushey, Kellett, Lenko, Mayor Castelli.
 Nays: None.

Notice to Terminate Ferndale Fire Protection Agreement

11-2747

Motion by Commissioner Kellett, second by Commissioner Lenko, that the City of Pleasant Ridge terminate the Agreement with the City of Ferndale for fire protection services, effective July 1, 2013, as allowed under the provisions of the amended Contract, and that the City Commission authorize the City Manager to deliver the notice of termination to the City of Ferndale City Manager.

Adopted: Yeas: Commissioners Kellett, Lenko, Bushey, Rubino, Mayor Castelli.
 Nays: None.

Mayor Castelli recessed the meeting at 9:34 p.m..
Mayor Castelli reconvened the meeting at 9:48 p.m.

Consent Agenda

11-2748

Motion by Commissioner Bushey, second by Commissioner Kellett, that the Consent Agenda be approved, as recommended.

Adopted: Yeas: Commissioners Bushey, Kellett, Lenko, Rubino, Mayor Castelli.
 Nays: None.

Supplemental Appropriation #A-2011-011, A-2011-12, A-2011-13, A-2011-14

11-2749

Motion by Commissioner Kellett, second by Commissioner Rubino, that Supplemental Appropriation #A-2011-011, #A-2011-012, #A-2011-013 and #A-2011-014, be approved, as recommended.

Adopted: Yeas: Commissioners Kellett, Rubino, Bushey, Lenko, Mayor Castelli.
 Nays: None.

2011-2012 Budget, Millage Rates and 5-Year Capital Improvement Plan

Mr. Scott Pietrzak, Assistant City Manager and Amy Allison, City Clerk, gave a brief presentation on the proposed 2011-2012 Budget, the 2011 Millage Rates and the 2012-2016 Five-year Capital Improvement Plan.

Mayor Castelli opened the public hearing at 10:04 p.m.

With no further comments or discussion, Mayor Castelli closed the public hearing at 10:05 p.m.

11-2750

Motion by Commissioner Kellett, second by Commissioner Bushey, that the 2011-2012 Combined City Budgets and 2012-2016 Five-Year Capital Improvement Plan be approved and that the Budget Resolution be adopted, including the levying of 11.4248 mils for the General Fund Operating, 2.4124 mils for Infrastructure Improvements, 1.7134 mils for Solid Waste and Disposal, 0.3700 mils for Library Services, 1.2722 mils for Community Center Complex Operations, and 1.0000 mils for Community Center Complex Debt Service be approved, as recommended.

Adopted: Yeas: Commissioners Kellett, Bushey, Lenko, Rubino, Mayor Castelli.
Nays: None.

Ordinance 396 – 2011 Water and Sewer Rates

Mayor Castelli opened the public hearing at 10:08 p.m.

Mr. Thomas Eagleson, 68 Oakdale, questioned why the minimum charge on the water bill for certain size meters is higher than the proposed rate.

City Manager Ball indicated she would follow up with Mr. Eagleson in writing.

With no further comments or discussion, Mayor Castelli closed the public hearing at 10:12 p.m.

11-2751

Motion by Commissioner Bushey, second by Commissioner Rubino, that Ordinance No. 396, regarding the combined water and sewer rate be adopted, as recommended.

Adopted: Yeas: Commissioners Bushey, Rubino, Kellett, Lenko, Mayor Castelli.
Nays: None.

Assessing Services Contract with Oakland County 2011-2013

11-2752

Motion by Commissioner Kellett, second by Commissioner Lenko, that the contract with Oakland County Equalization Division Assistance Services for assessing services effective July 1, 2011 through June 30, 2013, be approved, and that the Mayor, City Clerk, City Manager and City Attorney be authorized to sign the contract.

Adopted: Yeas: Commissioners Kellett, Lenko, Bushey, Rubino, Mayor Castelli.
 Nays: None.

Oakland County Urban County (CDBG) Agreement 2011-2013

11-2753

Motion by Commissioner Lenko, second by Commissioner Bushey, that the City of Pleasant Ridge resolve to participate in Oakland County's Urban County Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) programs for the years 2012, 2013 and 2014. Further, we resolve to remain in Oakland County's Urban County Community Development programs, which shall be automatically renewed in successive three-year qualification periods of time, or until such time that it is in the best interest of the local Community to terminate the Cooperative Agreement.

Adopted: Yeas: Commissioners Lenko, Bushey, Kellett, Rubino, Mayor Castelli.
 Nays: None.

City Manager's Report

Community Garden Grand Opening and Planting is scheduled for Saturday, June 18, 2011, Gainsboro Park.

The Pleasant Ridge Trolley, sponsored by the DDA, will be running on Friday, June 25, 2011, 6:00 p.m. to midnight.

DDA Concert in the Park will be held Wednesday, July 27, 2011, Stephenson Park, 6:00 p.m. to 10:00 p.m.

Kenberton Road Reconstruction Project will begin July 5, 2011. The pre-construction meeting with Kenberton residents will be held Thursday, June 28, 2011.

Ice Cream Social will be held Wednesday, July 13, 2011, Gainsboro Park, 6:00 p.m.

Other Business

Commissioner Rubino requested the City Manager follow up with information related to transferring some of the costs associated with the water bills to taxes.

With no further business, Mayor Castelli adjourned the meeting at 10:19 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Ralph A. Castelli, Jr., Mayor

Amy M. Allison, City Clerk